

New Orleans Historic District Landmarks Commission  
Meeting Minutes

Date: October 9, 2014

Location: City Council Chamber, 1300 Perdido Street, New Orleans, Louisiana.

Called to order: 1:05 p.m.

Adjourned: 4:30 p.m.

Commissioners present: Calvin Alexander, Marlene Jaffe, Greg Hackenberg, Ed de Montluzin, Matthew Lindsay, Dwight Norton, Heather Szapary, Jenna Burke, Katye Fayard, Jesse Leblanc

Commissioners arriving after beginning of the meeting: Jeanne Nathan

Commissioners absent: John Deveney, Jason Stopa

**I. Minutes**

A. Minutes of the September 11, 2014 meeting

Motion: Approve the meeting minutes with corrections.

By: Marlene Jaffe

Seconded: Jenna Burke

Result: Passed

In favor: Calvin Alexander, Marlene Jaffe, Greg Hackenberg, Ed de Montluzin, Matthew Lindsay, Dwight Norton, Heather Szapary, Jenna Burke, Katye Fayard

Opposed:

Comments:

**II. CONSENT AGENDA**

- A. 641 St Ferdinand St: Fernandez & Johnson Architect, applicant; Tatum H Neill, owner; Construct new, one-story, 2600 sq ft, single-family residence on existing vacant lot.
- B. 3101 St Thomas St: Joseph Hermo, applicant; Cooper Stevedoring Co Inc, owner; Construct two-story, single-family residence on an existing vacant lot.
- C. 5701 Dauphine St: C Kent & Associates, applicant; Stephanie P Gibson, owner; New construction of a 1600.s.f single family residential building.
- D. 2116-2118 Burgundy St: Eric Epstein, applicant; W Epstein Revocable Trust Eric, owner; Construct camelback addition.
- E. 3230 Camp St (3212 Camp St): Daniel Zangara, applicant; Bch Nola 3230 Camp LLC, owner; Construction of a two-story, single-family residence on an existing vacant lot.
- F. 3149 St Thomas St: Richard E Boe, applicant; Development South LLC, Richard E Boe, owner; Construct a one-story, two-family residence and detached accessory building on an existing vacant lot.
- G. 2373-2375 Laurel St: Kim Finney, applicant; Hill, Jr Riddle, owner; Enclose existing porch at side elevation and construct 2nd floor addition above.

- H. 1442 St Claude Ave: Alex Modinger, applicant; Providence Community Housing, owner; New construction of a two family residential building.
- I. 2401-2403 St Claude Ave: Lacey Wotring, applicant; Selina K Funches, owner; General renovation and restoration of existing building, including construction of 700 sf, one-story addition.
- J. 1500 St Charles Ave: John Guarnieri, applicant; D J E, LLC, owner; New construction of a 40,000 sf hotel, as Phase I of development. Massing only.
- K. 1207 Gallier St: Marc Robert, applicant; Andrew Dewitt, True Star Properties Inc, owner; Construction of a camelback addition on an existing single shotgun residential building.
- L. 2509 Carondelet St (2513 Carondelet St): Jc Carroll, applicant; The Alex Of Metairie LLC, owner; Construct two-story, single-family residence on existing vacant lot.

Motion: Suspend the rules

By: Marlene Jaffe

Seconded: Heather Szapary

Result: Passed

In Favor: Calvin Alexander, Marlene Jaffe, Greg Hackenberg, Ed de Montluzin, Matthew Lindsay, Dwight Norton, Heather Szapary Jenna Burke, Katye Fayard

Opposed:

Motion: Remove 1500 St. Charles Avenue from the Consent Agenda.

By: Marlene Jaffe

Seconded: Heather Szapary

Result: Passed

In Favor: Calvin Alexander, Marlene Jaffe, Greg Hackenberg, Ed de Montluzin, Matthew Lindsay, Dwight Norton, Heather Szapary Jenna Burke, Katye Fayard

Opposed:

Motion: Reinstate the rules.

By: Marlene Jaffe

Seconded: Heather Szapary

Result: Passed

In Favor: Calvin Alexander, Marlene Jaffe, Greg Hackenberg, Ed de Montluzin, Matthew Lindsay, Dwight Norton, Heather Szapary Jenna Burke, Katye Fayard

Opposed:

Motion: Approve Consent Agenda.

By: Matthew Lindsay

Seconded: Calvin Alexander

Result: Passed

In favor: Calvin Alexander, Marlene Jaffe, Greg Hackenberg, Ed de Montluzin, Matthew Lindsay, Dwight Norton, Heather Szapary Jenna Burke, Katye Fayard

Opposed:

Comments:

At this time Jeanne Nathan arrived.

### **III. NEW BUSINESS WORK APPLICATIONS**

#### **A. 2113-15 Chartres Street**

Application: This item was withdrawn.

The Commission then took up Item II. J. from the Consent Agenda.

#### **II. J. 1500 St. Charles Avenue**

Motion: Conceptual approval of the Massing Only, with the recommendations of the ARC.

By: Ed deMontluzin

Seconded: Greg Hackenberg

Result: Passed

In favor: Marlene Jaffe, Greg Hackenberg, Ed de Montluzin, Matthew Lindsay, Dwight Norton, Heather Szapary Jenna Burke, Katie Fayard, Jeanne Nathan, Calvin Alexander

Opposed:

Comments: Several neighbors spoke regarding their concerns related to congestion and parking.

The Commission then returned to the regular agenda.

### **IV. NEW BUSINESS WORK APPLICATIONS– SOLAR PANELS**

#### **A. 618 Andry Street**

Application: Installation of solar panels in a visibly prominent location.

Motion: Approve the application provided the panels are black with black frames and that the panels will be installed in as rectilinear arrangement as possible.

By: Calvin Alexander

Seconded: Jeanne Nathan

Result: Passed

In Favor: Marlene Jaffe, Greg Hackenberg, Dwight Norton, Heather Szapary Jenna Burke, Katie Fayard, Jeanne Nathan, Calvin Alexander

Opposed: Ed deMontluzin, Matthew Lindsay

#### **B. 5028 Burgundy Steet**

Application: Installation of solar panels in a visibly prominent location.

Motion: Deny Application

By: Calvin Alexander

Seconded: Marlene Jaffe

Result: Passed

In favor: Marlene Jaffe, Greg Hackenberg, Ed de Montluzin, Matthew Lindsay, Dwight Norton, Heather Szapary Jenna Burke, Katie Fayard, Jeanne Nathan, Calvin Alexander

#### **C. 200 Verret Street**

Application: Installation of solar panels in a visibly prominent location.

Motion: Withdrawn

## **V. OLD BUSINESS DEMOLITION APPLICATIONS**

### **A. 1022 N Dorgenois Street**

Application: Demolition of building.

This matter was deferred to end of agenda to allow time for Code Enforcement to arrive.

### **B. 501 Belleville Street**

Application: Demolition of building.

Motion: Deny demolition

By: Heather Szapary

Seconded: Jenna Burke

In favor: Matthew Lindsay, Katye Fayard, Marlene Jaffe, Greg Hackenberg, Jenna Burke, Heather Szapary

Ed deMontluzin, Jeanne Nathan

Opposed: Calvin Alexander

Comments:

## **VI. NEW BUSINESS DEMOLITION APPLICATIONS**

### **A. 5709 Royal Street**

Application: This item was withdrawn.

## **VII. NEW BUSINESS RETENTION APPLICATIONS**

### **A. 414 Tupelo Street**

Application: Retention of shutters and front door installed in deviation of CofA.

Motion: Approve the application for retention of the shutters provided they are painted. This will mitigate the visibility of the elements of the shutters that deviate from the HDLC Guidelines making them more closely resemble traditional panel shutters.

Deny the application for retention of the front door but granted 12 months for replacement.

By: Calvin Alexander

Seconded: Jenna Burke

Jeanne Nathan offered a friendly amendment that the Commission allow 18 months for the door to be replaced. The maker of the motion and the second accepted the friendly amendment.

Result: Passed

In favor: Matthew Lindsay, Katye Fayard, Calvin Alexander, Marlene Jaffe, Greg Hackenberg, Jenna Burke, Heather Szapary, Ed de Montluzin, Jeanne Nathan

Opposed:

Comments:

### **B. 921 Atlantic Avenue**

Application: Retention of four (4) surface mounted vinyl windows on left side elevation with wood screens added; work completed without a Certificate of Appropriateness.

Motion: Defer action on this application approximately 60 days so the applicant may investigate whether the existing vinyl windows may be recessed into the wall.

By: Heather Szapary

Seconded: Ed de Montluzin

In favor: Matthew Lindsay, Katye Fayard, Calvin Alexander, Marlene Jaffe, Greg Hackenberg, Jenna Burke, Heather Szapary, Ed de Montluzin, Jeanne Nathan

Opposed:

Comments:

C. 722 Delery Street

Application: Retention of inappropriate front door and removal of louvered shutters without CofA.

Motion: Deny the retention but grant 18 months to replace the inappropriate front door.

By: Calvin Alexander

Seconded: Katye Fayard

Result: Passed

In favor: Matthew Lindsay, Katye Fayard, Calvin Alexander, Marlene Jaffe, Greg Hackenberg, Jenna Burke, Heather Szapary, Ed de Montluzin, Jeanne Nathan

Opposed:

Comments:

D. 930 Melpomene Street

Application: Retention of wood-grained Hardi Plank siding.

Motion: Approve the retention of the wood grained Hardieplank siding as installed on side elevation but deny the retention of it on the front elevation.

By: Ed de Montluzin

Seconded: Heather Szapary

Result: Passed

In favor: Matthew Lindsay, Katye Fayard, Calvin Alexander, Marlene Jaffe, Jenna Burke, Heather Szapary, Ed de Montluzin, Jeanne Nathan

Opposed:

Comments: Greg Hackenberg recused himself.

E. 1917 Camp Street

Application: Retention of front porch columns, handrails and security doors that were installed without CofA.

Motion: Defer action on this application for 60 days so that the City Attorney can clarify legal matters pertaining to the length of time HDLC has jurisdiction over violations.

By: Matthew Lindsay

Seconded: Greg Hackenberg

Result: Passed

In favor: Matthew Lindsay, Katye Fayard, Calvin Alexander, Marlene Jaffe, Greg Hackenberg, Jenna Burke, Heather Szapary, Ed de Montluzin, Jeanne Nathan

Opposed:

Comments:

F. 1600 Governor Nicholls

Application: Retention of removal of existing true-divided light wood windows and installation of simulated divided light clad windows at side elevations in deviation of Certificate of Appropriateness.

Motion: Defer action on this application until the next Commission meeting so that you may meet with Staff on-site to determine the appropriateness and material of the windows installed

By: Marlene Jaffe

Seconded: Heather Szapary

Result: Passed

In favor: Matthew Lindsay, Katye Fayard, Calvin Alexander, Marlene Jaffe, Greg Hackenberg, Jenna Burke, Heather Szapary, Ed de Montluzin, Jeanne Nathan

Opposed:

Comments:

G. 1519 St. Philip Street

Application: Retention of inappropriate siding.

Motion: Allow retention.

By: Greg Hackenberg

Seconded: Marlene Jaffe

Result: Passed

In favor: Matthew Lindsay, Katye Fayard, Calvin Alexander, Marlene Jaffe, Greg Hackenberg, Jenna Burke, Heather Szapary, Ed de Montluzin, Jeanne Nathan

Opposed:

Comments:

The Commission then returned to Item V. A.

1022 North Dorgenois Street

Application: Demolition of building.

Motion: Defer action on this application until the next Commission meeting so that a representative from Code Enforcement can attend the meeting.

By: Jenna Burke

Seconded: Matthew Lindsay

Result: Passed

In favor: Matthew Lindsay, Katye Fayard, Calvin Alexander, Marlene Jaffe, Greg Hackenberg, Jenna Burke, Heather Szapary, Ed de Montluzin, Jeanne Nathan

Opposed:

Comments:

**IX. HDLC REPORTS AND COMMUNICATIONS**